



CALIFORNIA COALITION FREEDOM

White Paper

Responses to Independence Counter Arguments

May 14, 2017

Californiafreedomcoalition.com

DRAFT

Purpose

The concept of California leaving America to become an independent nation burst into the spotlight in the media from November 2016 to March 2017 ...and the debate keeps going on. This is a first attempt to address all of the concerns brought up in the popular news about this concept.

This white paper is intended to further debate by providing logic and facts that many California independence leaders have expressed during internal debates about critiques of the idea of California independence from America. This white paper is only meant to be a first draft, with other drafts continuing to be published as more questions are asked and more good answers are discovered.

Methodology

List of critiques came from articles in these media organizations between November 20 2016 to March 9 2017:

Fresno Bee, Sacramento Bee, LA Times, LA Weekly, Reno Gazette, National Review, Huffington Post, Atlantic, East Bay Times, San Francisco Chronicle, San Diego Union Tribune, Forbes, Politico, Snopes, New York Times, Washington Post, The Week, News Press Now, Union Democrat, Foreign Policy, CBS, Vice, Inquirer, KQED, Bloomberg, Breitbart, Hot Air, Mercury News, CNBC, ABC, CBS, NBC, MSNBC, CNN, KTLA, KTVU, FOX, KUSI,

Responses were collected from independence leaders during March 2016 to April 2017.

Table of Contents

- Counter Argument – Colorado river will be cut off ..7
- Counter Argument – America will not help in a natural or financial disaster ..5-6
- Counter Argument – America will invade, this will cause a civil war ..7
- Counter Argument – California does not have a military ..7
- Counter Argument – It is not legal to become independent ..8
- Counter Argument – America will never let you go, even if it is legal to leave ..9-10
- Counter Argument – Federal funds will be cut ..11
- Counter Argument – California is not a donor state ..11
- Counter Argument – This hurts democracy to leave when things don't go your way ..12-14
- Counter Argument – This is abandoning liberals and America ..15
- Counter Argument – You should agree to work harder to fix America ..15
- Counter Argument – This is about hurting America, making it weak ..16
- Counter Argument – Northern counties will leave, this will cause California to split ..17
- Counter Argument – Conservatives in California will never support ..18
- Counter Argument – Republican Party is orchestrating ..18
- Counter Argument – California politicians do not support the movement ..19
- Counter Argument – This is a fringe movement ..20
- Counter Argument – Californians will never get a majority to agree ..20
- Counter Argument – Movement is not supported by real Californians ..20
- Counter Argument – Foreign government is orchestrating this ..21
- Counter Argument – California is not a nation ..22-24
- Counter Argument – California is in debt ..25
- Counter Argument – This will result in taxes going up in California ..26
- Survey of movement leaders – how would you sell California independence ..27
- Survey of movement leaders – how would you explain California independence ..28-29



.....

The Colorado River water will be cut off - California will have no water

Talking Points

- Cut off our water and we cut off cheap imports to the rest of the USA.
- Most of the water used here, is already here. Only a small portion comes from outside California.
- The development of small scale reservoirs and catchment systems is smart water management in both drought and heavy rainfall. Especially important with climate change, and would provide excellent infrastructure employment.
- Multi-national corporations like Nestle should be prohibited from bottling our water and selling elsewhere.
- It is to the benefit of America to maintain water flow to California in exchange for crop purchase.
- Promoting conservation and sustainability in agriculture, commercial and home use is important regardless of Colorado Facts.

FACTS

90% of America's fruit and vegetables are provided by California. Without the water, California can't make that food and America will be left with only eating corn, potatoes, and wheat every day.

More than 60% of the water for California comes from the mountains in California, managed by the Federal government. Researchers at UC Merced found that if the Federal government managed the forest better, they could produce up to 16% more water.

The Colorado river really is only an issue for the LA area, not all of California.

The largest desalination plan in the western hemisphere is in California, built in the last few years, at the cost of \$1B. It is just south of LA in Carlsbad. If California had \$30B extra tax money each year, it could literally build 30 more of these giant desalination plants – in one year. In just 2 years California could build 60 desalination plants off the coast of LA.

America will not help CA in a natural or financial disaster

Talking Points

- So what? With the tax money we will save, we will be very well able to help ourselves.
- Whenever there is a natural disaster anywhere in the world, America is the first to help.
- Part of starting an Independent California Nation is developing mutual assistance strategies with neighboring Countries. There is no reason that over time a plan that benefits both America and California won't be implemented. Look at the strong alliance between the UK and America, despite the initial break.
- "When flood waters engulfed the Midwest, when hurricanes swamped the East Coast, Californians were willing to help. Now, Californians need the nation's help." - Governor Wilson 1994
- "We got no help from the Federal government." – Governor Davis 2003
- North Carolina received just 1% of what it asked for in Hurricane Matthew relief funds 2017.

FACTS

We barely get anything now.

1989 Earthquake – It took more than 2 years after the event for the Federal government to actually pay for assistance. California raised taxes to rebuild.

1992 Recession - California needs help out of recession and is denied by the Federal government.

1994 Earthquake – Federal government did not cover full costs of rebuilding, California had to come up with money. Governor criticized Federal government for not doing enough given how much California pays to America.

2000 Power failure – massive electrical grid brownouts occur because the price of power was too high. Federal government provided no assistance, and refused to look into why the issue was occurring for 3 years. After which it turns out that Texas based energy companies illegally lied to California consumers which caused the power failure. California was not compensated for damages and the Federal government did not force Texas companies to pay California a fair share.

America will not help California in a financial or natural disaster

FACTS

2001 Terrorist attack - California was the most vulnerable to terrorist attack in America according to Homeland Security after 911. Yet it took 5 years for California to get the funding it deserved. California ports had to raise taxes on themselves to pay for terrorist prevention.

2006 Earthquake - Its revealed FEMA has no plans for how to deal with a big California earthquake.

2008 Forest fires - are all over California and the Federal government denied help. In fact, the Federal government refuses to implement natural burning cycles which would prevent fires in the first place.

2010 Recession - California again denied help by the Federal government.

2016 Forest fires - Are out of control in California and Federal government denies help.

America will invade - this has to end up in a Civil War

Talking Points

- Why would they bother? We have no intention of using force or violating laws. The overwhelming perception from most of the “red states” is negative towards California.
- All proposed methods of gaining Independence are dependent upon International support and peaceful negotiations with America.
Also imagine the world wide outrage. Nope. Not going to happen. This is a peaceful secession.

California does not have a military

Talking Points

- We have a small one and we could certainly build upon it.
- A military based on defense, not adventures in regime change and wars for profit.
- Won't need it.

FACTS



It is not legal to become independent

Talking Points

- It *is* legal to become independent. The State of California has written an impact statement on the ballot initiative and outlines the legal precedent for being able to leave America.
- California was won in a war with a treaty that was promptly ignored by America, we never signed up for this in the first place.
- There is a legal process for departure, we need a super majority of states to agree to it.

FACTS

California Attorney General Kathleen Kenealy said on Jan 10 2017 when talking about the California independence initiative that the only Supreme Court case on independence did say that a state could leave America “through consent of the states”.

"In 1869, following the Civil War, the U.S. Supreme Court ruled in Texas v. White that the initial act admitting a state into the Union "was final." "There was no place for reconsideration, or revocation," the court said, "except through revolution, or through consent of the states."

California Attorney General Xavier Becerra said on Feb 10 2017 when interviewed by the New York Times that independence was difficult, but not illegal.

California constitution center at UC Berkeley on Nov 12 2016 said that the only Supreme Court case on independence did say that you could leave America “through consent of the states”.

America will never let California go, you will never get the votes in the American Congress, even if it is legal to leave America

Talking Points

- That remains to be seen. There are a great many people in the red states who believe that we can't get along without them. They would love to see us separate so they can watch us fail. They really don't like us. We may very well get the votes when the time comes.
- We may not need the votes. No legal precedent has been set.
- Many states already resent California, falsely perceiving us as having outsized influence. We do not share a culture, history or belief system with the majority of America.
- "If Trump were ever elected, we'd have to build a wall around California to defend ourselves from the rest of this country," - Governor Brown 2016

FACTS

March 2017 - Rasmussen reports polled Americans and found that 31% said its okay for California to leave America.

October 2014 National voter poll conducted by FOX News shows that half of Americans want California "kicked out of the Union".

August 2013 American National magazine "Business Insider" conducts poll showing that Americans hate California the most and would like to see it leave America.

February 2012 San Francisco Chronicle asks in headline "Why do so many people hate California?"

February 2012 LA Weekly announces that "California is America's most-hated state".

February 2012 Poll by "Public Policy Polling" shows that Americans have the most negative opinion of California by far, in comparison to any other state.

Federal funds will be cut

Talking Points

- We give a lot more to the feds than we get. 60 to 70 billion dollars a year will be coming our way.
- We already have the American government stealing \$60-70B USD from California. What's to cut?
- Federal taxes currently paid to America will be paid to California, we will actually have more money available for our needs.
- "...It doesn't make sense to me for the Federal Government to ... insist that the only solution to our local problems is for them to take the money and then dispense it back to you in grants."– Governor Reagan 1967

California is not a donor state, it breaks even with the Federal government

Talking Points

- Many newspapers have confirmed that California is a donor state for the last couple decades – where they all wrong?
- "The federal government is part of our problem. We are currently owed billions of dollars by the federal government for various programs. We no longer can ignore what is owed to us." - Governor Schwarzenegger 2010
- "Until a sincere effort is made at the federal level to reach an equitable agreement on these funds, I find it difficult to see how meaningful progress can be made..." Governor Deukmejian 1985

FACTS

.....

This hurts democracy to leave when things don't go your way, this is about Liberals crying

Talking Points

- I would not know. I am not a liberal. I am fiscally conservative and socially liberal --- and I do not believe in nametags or labels.
- There are a range of political beliefs represented in the movement for California Independence. Many have wanted this for a long time. The recent election just highlighted the differences, and the complete lack of representation for California. Much like the spark that ignited the Boston Tea Party and declaration of Independence.
- Hurt democracy? It will be a democratic process. The people will be getting what they vote for. How does that hurt democracy? As for the, "Liberals crying," thing, that is known as an ad hominem argument. You're calling us names rather than discussing our assertions. The remark is irrelevant.

FACTS

.....

Conservatives will never support

Talking Points

- Yes they do. This is a lie.
- It is too early to tell. We need to work harder to address the concrete issues that the conservatives have, particularly in the central valley.
- An emphasis on local control, one less layer of regulation, and a more direct, non-corporate election system will appeal to the more libertarian type of conservatives that are more the California norm than the extreme religious right.

The Republican party is orchestrating this

Talking Points

- Another ad hominem. The Republicans also agree that $2+2=4$. They also agree that the sky is blue. Must those things therefore be wrong? I have decided that a move towards California independence would be good for me. If Republicans want to join me, so much the better.
- If some initial leaders were Republican, it just means the idea appeals to a large cross-section of Californians.
- We have broad support from multiple political parties and a huge amount of Independents. Nobody cares who you voted for or if you have not voted in the past as long as you support California Independence.

FACTS



This is a fringe movement

Talking Points

- Movements initially considered fringe include :
Votes for women, abolition, marriage equality, and on and on and on.
- California possibly leaving America has made every newspaper and TV news in California and it is still fringe?

Californians will never get a majority of California to agree to independence

Talking Points

- At least 45% are willing to look at it. The other 20% just want to see what everyone else thinks first.
- Polls already show a third of Californians agreeing. Like any new idea, support grows over time, look at marijuana or marriage equality. Fortunately, due to social media and the internet, acceptance can be gained much more quickly than in the past.
- We are growing by leaps and bounds as of now. Again, too early to tell.

Movement is not supported by real Californians

Talking Points

- I'm a real Californian. Going back many, many generations. California is a nation of immigrants, from inside and outside the U.S. - we welcome everyone. They are just as "real" as I am.
- LOL. Wake up and read the real news.

FACTS



FACTS

California is not a nation

Talking Points

- California has been a nation within a nation for over 200 years.
- You're right. We're hoping to change that.
- Our characteristics are all more relevant to a large nation. Demographics, resources, population, culture, economy.

.....

FACTS

This will result in taxes going up in California

Talking Points

- Nope. Not if we do not pay into the DC system the \$60-70B. In fact, a flat tax for everyone would work best.
- Over time taxes should remain the same, or decrease. Systems will be streamlined without the American government and California both implementing regulations.
- Less money going to support foreign military involvement. The taxes collected will provide greater services for the community. You will be able to see where your money goes.

.....

How would you sell California independence

- Let her shine
- A new golden age for the Golden state
- California nation: in charge of our own destiny
- Let our golden state shine
- Sustainably golden
- Protection, Profit and Progress for All!
- California knows what's best, For it SELF
- California Values, California Democracy, California Nation.
- Westcoast values, Westcoast Democracy, Westcoast Nation.
- California on Trajectory to Become the Capital of the Pacific Rim in the 21st Century
- California = different culture, different history, different nation
- California's economy and culture does not fit in America
- Stop America from stealing California's gold
- Caged no more, Freedom to the Grizzly

- Securing life, liberty, and pursuit of happiness

How would you explain California independence

- I've wanted an Independent California Nation since I first figured out that we would never have a real voice in the policies that impact us. We are vastly under-represented not only in the electoral-college and thus all the administrative decisions AND the judiciary --but even more so in the Senate.
- Our experiences, culture, economics, history and social understandings are not similar to most of America - yet their local and regional issues and needs carry far more weight than ours. That won't change no matter who currently leads America. An Independent California means WE can shape our government to fit OUR needs.
- Let me ask you a question. Do you want to live in a community where the democracy is good or bad? That is, do you want to live in a real democratic society where you actually have a real say in the laws of your community or are you ok with a bad democracy where political parties, special interests, and other persons thousands of miles away are controlling the laws in your community?
- It is now time to take the 'Training Wheels Off 'the move to California Nationhood has arrived if only to be used as a hammer and force the Congressional deaf ears in Washington DC that the 5th largest Economy . (California) will no longer be ignored and continue to pour \$20 billion a year into Washington DC only to see our voices ignored.
- California assumed the responsibility both domestically and globally to protect the worlds democracies from Trump, Putin and his Russian bullies and or a tone deaf congress bought and paid for by a hand full of billionaires. California's successes as a Global economic power deny the state from sitting on the side-lines any longer.
- Yes it took a Pearl Harbor Moment like the joint Trump/Putin attack on the American Presidential electoral process for California to rise up and assume its earned position. California is already a nation State. Additionally another important reality to California

Independence must not be overlooked. If California was to flex its muscle as a new nation state it is not inconceivable the Nation of California would dramatically impact geo-political landscape.

- We are overtaxed and underrepresented, and have been for most of California's existence. That's the elephant in the room. That's what continues to justify the American Revolution in our folklore 250 years later. Same issue. Same justification. Just peaceful this time. The 21st century version.
- America has become exponentially larger and more diverse than the Framers could ever have imagined when they created a democratic system that has as its implicit core the concept of consensus. The devolution of consensus governance over the past 40 years is accelerating. While no one wants to live in an echo chamber politically speaking, there has to be enough common ground among the various political factions for consensus governance to be a realistic prospect and that is demonstrably no longer the case in America as it currently exists.
- The simple fact is that America has become too large and too disparate to effectively govern itself. This is most amply demonstrated in the complete gridlock of Washington for the past 20 years.
- The Federal government has committed many atrocities towards its own people from medical experimentation, segregation, abuse of the disabled with many suffering inhumane experimentation, slavery and discrimination that causes the suffering, torture, and deaths of millions of its own people. That is even more reason to want to separate from that history.

